

Dean Ciaran

Subject: FW: Tregarthen's Hotel Planning Application P18/031/FUL AND P/18/032/ADV
Attachments: 20180506_122600.jpg

Sent: 16 May 2018 12:54

To: Walton Lisa

Subject: RE: Tregarthen's Hotel Planning Application P18/031/FUL AND P/18/032/ADV

Dear Ms Walton,

Thank you for the discussion on the revised plans for Tregarthen's Hotel. We are concerned that independent houses are to be built rather than the development of an integrated unified apartment/hotel that would benefit Scilly and its Tourism industry. In our view the proposal should be a coherent plan, rectifying mistakes in the current buildings, rather than adding on other buildings that compromise the old cottage and sea front area and guest sea views from the hotel. The hotel is in a very prominent position, being one of the gateways to the islands and this needs to be respected.

Hence:

1. The plans that are already approved, offered Scilly an updated and improved Tregarthen's Hotel, particularly with the pitched roof on the staff block.
2. In our view, the new plans are a step backwards, as the proposed new cottages dominate the site, particularly when viewed from the quay. The new cottages also dominate the old cottages and obscure the staff block, which with proposed enhancement would have created greater harmony amongst the bulk of the hotel buildings. The new buildings will also compromise the outlook from our home by restricting part of our view to the Mermaid/quay area.
3. The new cottages are set very close to the old cottages, affecting their natural light and long-established views to the west. The new cottages also take away the proposed garden under the approved plans, which would have been returned to what was once a well-maintained garden used by hotel guests, rather than being a rubbish dump and problems with vermin. As the site has never being built upon, it may be of significant interest to the archaeologist, being so close to the old quay and the Garrison Walls.
4. Under the new plans the staff block is "hidden", not only taking away its views, but it also appears to have "lost" the building enhancements that would have improved the overall look of the site. The removal of these sea views is a retrograde step from a hotel guest perspective.
5. The location of Tregarthen's is probably the best hotel location on St Mary's. Many rooms have sea views. The dining room with views to the quay and the west is probably the best located dining area on St Mary's. These will all be compromised, being replaced by views of the roof tops of the new cottages.
6. The artist's sketch is totally misleading and should not be considered as part of the submission. A photograph is attached and if the new cottages were imposed on the photograph, it would demonstrate that the bulk of the new cottages are not in keeping with the attributes of the site.
7. The proposed balcony on the original main building will be of little use if the proposed new cottages are built, as the balcony view of the sea will be blocked by the roof of the staff block. It will also compromise our privacy, as guests will be able to overlook our home and garden from this building.
8. With respect to the lighting proposal. Scilly is not a city/town where it is necessary to light up signs to advertise hotels from other buildings. The Local Plan, OE4, calls for a dark skies policy and we already have

unnecessary lighting, polluting the night sky under the guise of H&S. The lighting should be rejected as unnecessary and not being in accordance with the Local Plan.

9. We would also question how many times it is necessary to write Tregarthen's Hotel on the buildings, as everyone knows the location of Tregarthen's Hotel.
10. Will filling the site with another building compromise the approved sewage and water tank plans?
11. Will the mature trees at the proposed new entrance on Garrison Hill remain?
12. We are unsure of the rationale of moving the flag pole, but its new position could be a sound nuisance to the Garrison Hill properties in high winds.

In conclusion, this email to the Council recommends that the plans should be rejected and that the already approved plans should be implemented to preserve and enhance a historic building in a dominant gateway location.

Kind regards
Alan & Glen Davis

Gunners Well
The Garrison
St Mary's
Isles of Scilly
TR21 0LS