



Historic England

Ms Lisa Walton
Council of the Isles of Scilly
Planning department, Town Hall
The Parade
St Mary's
Isles of Scilly
TR21 0LW

Direct Dial: 0117 975 0732

Our ref: P01315850

16 February 2021

Dear Ms Walton,

**T&CP (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015
& Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990**

**TREGARTHEN'S HOTEL, GARRISON HILL, HUGH TOWN, ST MARY'S, ISLES OF
SCILLY, TR21 0PP
Application No. P/20/090/FUL**

Thank you for your letter of 26 January 2021 regarding further information on the above application for planning permission. On the basis of this information, we offer the following advice to assist your authority in determining the application.

Historic England Advice

In our letter of 22 December 2020, Historic England briefly outlined both our previous involvement with development on this site, and the exceptional interest of the heritage assets within the immediate setting of the site. We ask that our current and previous letters are considered together.

Our letter of December outlined our concerns that the proposals would cause a change to views towards Garrison Hill, and partially obscure a section of the rubble walls which are important in understanding the significance and the broader setting of the Garrison Gate and Star Castle. We recommended that the layout of the lodges within the kitchen garden was amended to address this blocking effect, preferably by returning to an L-shaped arrangement as per the previous planning permission.

The application has now been amended. The layout of the holiday lodges has been slightly altered, and one lodge (closest to the wall) has been reduced in height to reduce its blocking effect on the Garrison Hill wall. We note the annotated drawing identifying the extent to which the wall will be obscured as a result of the amended proposal, in comparison to the previous planning consent.

We consider that this amendment goes a considerable way in addressing our



1ST FLOOR FERMENTATION NORTH FINZELS REACH HAWKINS LANE BRISTOL BS1 6JQ

Telephone 0117 975 1308
HistoricEngland.org.uk



Historic England is subject to both the Freedom of Information Act (2000) and Environmental Information Regulations (2004). Any Information held by the organisation can be requested for release under this legislation.



concerns. The blocking effect has been reduced and the rubble wall now has a continuous and unbroken line in most views, emphasising the significance of both it and Garrison Hill. The relocation of the lodges (albeit slight), in combination with the reduced height of one lodge, has reduced the impact of the proposal further and allowed the scheme to become more recessive within the site. Whilst we do remain of the opinion that an L shaped layout would generate further improvement to the scheme, we appreciate that this arrangement has partially addressed the impacts we identified.

Historic England considers that it is now for your authority to carry out a balancing exercise between the public benefits of the proposal and any residual low levels of harm (National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), paragraph 196). We also remind your authority of the need for a proportionate and appropriate scheme of archaeological monitoring and recording to be carried out, as recommended by your own archaeological advisors.

Recommendation

Historic England has no further comments to make on the application on heritage grounds. We consider that it is now for your authority to balance any heritage impacts with the public benefits of the proposal. We consider that the issues and safeguards outlined in our advice need to be addressed in order for the application to meet the requirements of the NPPF.

In determining this application you should bear in mind the statutory duty of section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess; and of section 72(1) of the same Act to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of conservation areas.

Your authority should take these representations into account in determining the application. If there are any material changes to the proposals, or you would like further advice, please contact us. Please advise us of the decision in due course.

Yours sincerely

Catherine Marlow

Catherine Marlow

Inspector of Historic Buildings and Areas

E-mail: Catherine.Marlow@HistoricEngland.org.uk





Historic England



1ST FLOOR FERMENTATION NORTH FINZELS REACH HAWKINS LANE BRISTOL BS1 6JQ

Telephone 0117 975 1308
HistoricEngland.org.uk



Historic England is subject to both the Freedom of Information Act (2000) and Environmental Information Regulations (2004). Any Information held by the organisation can be requested for release under this legislation.