

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/21/018/FUL

Consultation Response

Date: 19th March 2021**Ref:** P/21/018/FUL**Site:** Blockhouse Cottages, Old Grimsby, Tresco**Proposal:** Demolition of existing row of cottages, construction of new replacement two storey 5/6 bedroom dwelling, single storey annexe, single storey studio outbuilding extension, and associated landscaping works.

You are being consulted on this application as you may wish to make comments before a decision is made. Should you wish to make any comments on this application, please complete the response form below and return to planning@scilly.gov.uk by 13th April 2021 or by post to the Planning Department, Town Hall, The Parade, Hugh Town, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly TR21 0LW.

Link to application: <https://www.scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p21018>

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course. If I have not heard back from you by the 13th April 2021 then I will assume you have no comments to make.

Consultee Name: Cornwall Archaeological Unit

[Comments here](#)

Thank you for consulting us on this application. We have consulted the Cornwall & Isles of Scilly Historic Environment Record (HER) and the submitted documents, in particular the Heritage, Setting and Visual Impact Assessment (HIA) (Lewellyn Harker nd) and the Condition Survey (Currie and Brown Sept 2020).

The submitted HIA states that the Blockhouse Cottages were first recorded on the c1880 first edition Ordnance Survey map, but does not refer to the HER entry (MCO30191) for the cottages which states, 'A row of cottages west of the blockhouse built originally for the crew and their families of the Seven Stones lightship - first anchored on the Seven Stones reef in 1841. A notable feature of the cottages is the fact that all their windows face inland away from the sea.'

It is clear that the Cottages are a non-designated heritage asset, the significance of which needs to be established. While the HIA evaluates the potential impacts on the setting of the nearby Grade-II Listed Blockhouse (NHLE 1219196; MCO30189) and surrounding defences which form the Scheduled Monument (NHLE 1013662; MCO30189 and MCO30190) it makes little attempt to describe the Cottages from an historic building perspective or to evaluate their evidential, historical, communal or aesthetic heritage values and significance. Furthermore, the HIA does not assess how the Cottages

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning Application

Ref: P/21/018/FUL

contribute to the aesthetic value of Tresco's historic character and the significance of the Conservation Area, instead briefly discussing the built environment of New Grimsby and the setting of the nearby block house. In this respect, however, the HIA does state, 'The significance [of Old Grimsby Bay] is found in the form and materials of the two storey largely granite Houses, set back from the shoreline [...]'. The HIA, however, does not assess how Blockhouse Cottages relate to this stated historic character and significance.

Additionally, the HIA makes no reference to the archaeological potential of the application site, the potential impacts upon it and a suggested mitigation strategy (if required). The archaeological potential of the Isles of Scilly is well known as the Local Plan (2005) and the Isles of Scilly Research Framework (2019) both make clear.

The submitted proposed site plan (Site plan 3931_009E) shows that the scheme will require groundworks with the construction of the cycle store and studio and extended footprint of the proposed new cottages. The HIA needs to evaluate if there any features outside the Scheduled Area relating to the outer defences of the Blockhouse. The HER records two linear defences surviving as earthworks just 14m to the north east of the application site (MCO30193). A buried land surface 130m to the east of the application site is recorded in the HER (MCO30187). What is the potential for a buried land surface within the application site?

The use of the HER in helping to evaluate the significance of heritage assets is outlined in Paragraph 187 of the NPPF.

The submitted condition survey suggests that the existing cottages can be repaired and refurbished and does not make a recommendation for demolition, however, the covering letter suggests otherwise. The case for demolition, however, should be judged against the significance of the heritage asset. As Paragraph 184 of the NPPF makes clear, 'These [heritage] assets are an irreplaceable resource, and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance [...]'. Paragraph 197 adds, 'The effect of an application on the significance of a non-designated heritage asset should be taken in account in determining the application. In weighing applications that directly or indirectly affect non-designated heritage assets, a balanced judgement will be required having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the heritage asset.'

We cannot advise further until an amended HIA has been provided. We advise that this application should not be determined before the amended assessment has been received and we have had an opportunity to comment further. This amended HIA should be carried out by a suitably qualified organisation or individual in accordance with accepted national guidelines. This is in accordance with the provisions of NPPF (2019) Chapter 16, paragraph 189 and the Isles of Scilly Local Plan Policy 1. Should an adequate report not be forthcoming, then further consultation is advised before determination.

Name: Peter Dudley

Date: 06/04/2021