

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/21/093/FUL & P/21/094/LBC

Consultation Response

Date: 22nd November 2021

Ref: P/21/093/FUL & P/21/094/LBC

Site: Kavorna, Hugh Street, St Mary's

Proposal: Removal of store, replacement of existing scantle tiles with natural slate on south east

section of roof and removal of two internal partition walls. (Listed Building)

You are being consulted on these applications as you may wish to make comments

before a decision is made. Should you wish to make any comments on these

applications, please complete the response form below and return to

planning@scilly.gov.uk by 13th December 2021 or by post to the Planning Department,

Town Hall, The Parade, Hugh Town, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly TR21 0LW.

Link to application: https://www.scilly.gov.uk/planning-application/planning-application-p21094lbc

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course. If I have not heard back from you by the 13th December 2021 then I will assume you have no comments to make.

Consultee Name: Cornwall Archaeological Unit

Comments here

Thank you for consulting us on these applications (P/21/093/FUL & P/21/094/LBC) for proposed works to Kavorna, which is a Grade II Listed Building (NHLE 1218783). The listing description is not reproduced in the submitted Heritage (Impact) Statement (HS) (Paul Osborne nd) but is as follows,

'House, possibly originally 2 dwellings, now shop and flat. C18, with C19 and C20 alterations. Coursed granite rubble, with colourwashed render to front; gabled scantled slate roof; granite end stacks. L-plan with C18 rear left wing. 2 storeys; 4-window first-floor range. Ground floor has 2 inserted mid C20 segmental shop windows, 3/3-pane sash to right and 2 recessed doorways with half-glazed early C20 doors. Interior: plain C19 joists.' (Heritage Gateway).

Analysis of the c1880 of c1907 Ordnance Survey maps suggest that the building could have been subdivided in the late 19th/early 20th century. Both maps show the rear (south) wing which is considered in the listing description to be potentially of 18th century. The scantle slate roof may date to this period and is considered as a distinctive part of the building's architectural significance and part of the reason for its designation. It is not properly described in the submitted HS with no details of the existing roof structure, the likely origin of the slate, potential date and construction details including the lathes, roof trusses, hip details and whether the roof covering was originally wet laid and torched.

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/21/093/FUL & P/21/094/LBC

This roof has the potential to be of 18th century date but evidence relating to the significance of this historic fabric is not adequately assessed in the submitted HS.

We are also concerned that there is lack of detail in the application documents about the proposed reroofing scheme including where will the 'natural slate' be sourced, the fixings, the sizing (random?) of the slates and if they will be laid in diminishing courses (as a scantle roof) and if not, the justification for the proposal (and why the existing roof material cannot be re-laid on new lathes and re-pegged?).

We also note that the proposed elevation drawing (KV-PA-1a) shows that a door will be inserted into the current location of a window opening in the south elevation. The HS does not consider the significance of this window opening or provide any photographic evidence of this elevation.

The Heritage Statement needs to be amended with this further information to enable an informed decision about the potential effects of the proposed scheme on the significance of this Grade II Listed heritage asset, and the need (or not) for historic building recording, if conditional consent is granted.

This application should not be determined before the amended Heritage Statement is received and we have had an opportunity to comment further. This assessment should be carried out by a suitably qualified organisation or individual in accordance with accepted national guidelines. This is in accordance with the provisions of NPPF (2019) Chapter 16, paragraph 189 and Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly 2015-2030 Local Plan. Should an amended report not be forthcoming, then further consultation is advised before determination.

Name: Peter Dudley

Date: 30/11/2021