



Historic England

RECEIVED

By Lisa Walton at 3:09 pm, Mar 30, 2022

The Planning Officer

Direct Dial: 0117 975 0732

Council of the Isles of Scilly

Planning department, Town Hall

Our ref: P01469613

The Parade

St Mary's

Isles of Scilly

TR21 0LW

30 March 2022

Dear Sir/Madam,

**T&CP (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015
& Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Regulations 1990**

**TREGARTHEN'S HOTEL, GARRISON HILL, HUGH TOWN, ST MARY'S, ISLES OF
SCILLY, TR21 0PP
Application No. P/22/023/ROV**

Thank you for your letter of 11 March 2022 regarding the above application for planning permission. On the basis of the information available to date, we offer the following advice to assist your authority in determining the application.

Historic England Advice

The proposals comprise a revised scheme for development within the Tregarthen's Hotel site - the erection of five micro lodges for holiday letting, with associated waste treatment plant and landscaping.

Historic England has previously provided your authority with detailed assessments of



1ST FLOOR FERMENTATION NORTH FINZELS REACH HAWKINS LANE BRISTOL BS1 6JQ

Telephone 0117 975 1308
HistoricEngland.org.uk



Historic England is subject to both the Freedom of Information Act (2000) and Environmental Information Regulations (2004). Any Information held by the organisation can be requested for release under this legislation.



the significance of the designated heritage assets surrounding the Tregarthen's Hotel site (P/15/0101, HE Ref P00472897 24 September 2015; P/16/055, HE Ref P00514443 06 July 2016; P/18/031/FUL, HE Ref P00885830 4 June 2018; P/20/090/FUL HE Ref P01315850 20 December 2020 and 16 February 2021). We have also provided some pre-application advice on previous schemes, although not for the current proposals.

In relation to previous schemes, we had concerns that the proposals would cause a change to views towards Garrison Hill and partially obscure a section of the rubble walls which are important in understanding the significance and the broader setting of the Garrison Gate and Star Castle. We recommended that the layout of the lodges within the kitchen garden was amended to address this blocking effect. The layout of the holiday lodges was slightly altered, and one lodge (closest to the wall) was reduced in height to reduce its blocking effect on the Garrison Hill wall. We considered that the blocking effect previously raised as a concern had been reduced and the rubble wall behind the lodges appeared as a continuous and unbroken line in most views, emphasising the significance of both it and Garrison Hill.

After amendments made to address our heritage concerns, the most recent 2020 scheme was approved subject to conditions. The current proposals increase the height of the lodges, but they are set further down into the ground to compensate for this, meaning that their additional height in relation to the garrison wall is negligible. We therefore do not consider this height to change our previous position.

Historic England therefore considers that it is for your authority to carry out a balancing exercise between the public benefits of the proposal and (as per the previous scheme) any residual low levels of harm (National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), paragraph 196). We also remind your authority of the need for a proportionate and appropriate scheme of archaeological monitoring and recording to be carried out, as recommended by your own archaeological advisors.

Recommendation

Historic England has no specific comments to make on the application on heritage grounds but reminds your authority of our previous comments on the approved schemes. We consider that it is for your authority to balance any heritage impacts with the public benefits of the proposal. We consider that the issues and safeguards outlined in our advice need to be addressed in order for the application to meet the requirements of the NPPF.

In determining this application you should bear in mind the statutory duty of section 66(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess; and of section



1ST FLOOR FERMENTATION NORTH FINZELS REACH HAWKINS LANE BRISTOL BS1 6JQ

Telephone 0117 975 1308
HistoricEngland.org.uk





Historic England

72(1) of the same Act to pay special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of conservation areas.

Your authority should take these representations into account in determining the application. If there are any material changes to the proposals, or you would like further advice, please contact us. Please advise us of the decision in due course.

Yours sincerely

Catherine Marlow

Inspector of Historic Buildings and Areas

E-mail: Catherine.Marlow@HistoricEngland.org.uk



1ST FLOOR FERMENTATION NORTH FINZELS REACH HAWKINS LANE BRISTOL BS1 6JQ

Telephone 0117 975 1308
HistoricEngland.org.uk



Historic England is subject to both the Freedom of Information Act (2000) and Environmental Information Regulations (2004). Any Information held by the organisation can be requested for release under this legislation.