

Design and Access Statement
Essential Pedestrian Lighting
Micro Lodges
October 2023

Tregarthen's Hotel

I. Introduction

I.1 This proposal is for the erection of essential pedestrian safety lighting for the micro lodges that are now under construction in the former kitchen garden of Tregarthen's Hotel. following permission P/20/090/FUL (as amended).

I.2 The application is necessary following imposition of condition C4 which prohibits external lighting. The condition is as follows:

NO ADDITIONAL EXTERNAL Illumination

C4 Notwithstanding the information submitted with the application submission, no additional artificial external lighting shall be installed within the application site. Reason: In the interests of the character and appearance of the landscape and local amenity, and in the interests of the tranquillity and dark sky experience of the Islands in accordance with Policies 1 and 2 of the adopted Isles of Scilly Islands Local Plan 2005 and emerging draft Policy OE4 of the emerging Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2015-2030.

I.3 The planning and design statement set out the considerations for this proposal which has arisen following the need for express consent for external illumination.

I.4 The applicant is Tregarthen's Hotel Ltd.

The Proposal

I.5 The proposal is for essential lighting for safety purposes, it comprises 5 walkway lights at 1.2 metres high and five number fixed wall lights on the rear elevations at 1.8m all with directional lighting where the cowl is integral to the light fitting and cannot be removed.

I.6 The lighting will emit a warm white colour temperature light (3000 Kelvin or less) to reduce the potential for adverse effects onto potentially sensitive receptors.

I.1 The Proposed Luminaires have Dark Sky Approval.

I.2 The choice of fittings has been carefully selected to minimise light spill and direct lighting to the paths and steps to provide essential pedestrian safety.

I.3 The new lights will include replacements for the fixed lights on the rear wall of Hendra and Gibson which have given rise to complaints. These are low level, directional and face away from the neighbouring property and the Garrison wall.

I.4 The fixed wall lights are located at the rear entrance doors of the micro lodges. These are also directional and have an inbuilt cowl.

Tregarthen's Hotel

Lighting Considerations

- 1.5 The details of the light fittings are set out in the manufacturer's specification sheets submitted in support of the application.
- 1.6 Specific luminaires have been chosen for the purpose of ensuring light is thrown downwards and away from the sensitive receptors.
- 1.7 Motion detection PIR sensors, where applicable, will ensure the lights are only operational at the time it is needed keeping the area predominantly dark when not in use.
- 1.8 Providing safety lighting for pedestrians will help to discourage use of internal lights in the main room being left on to otherwise create a lit atmosphere and light spread outside the lodges for guests returning in the hours of darkness. The controlled safety lighting should therefore have less impact than not providing any exterior lighting.

Rationale

- 1.9 The proposal is principally for safety and is considered the minimum necessary for essential safety of guests and staff.

Planning Assessment

- I.10 The assessment of the planning application is a balance of all the considerations associated with the proposal, the site and the local environment. Whilst planning applications must be determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise as set out in Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and Section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act (1990) they must also pay regard to the guidance provided by the NPPF as a material consideration.
- I.11 The proposal for the micro lodges was considered consistent with the adopted policy WC5 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan which supports new visitor accommodation where it improves the quality and choice of existing tourism and responds to the changing needs and expectations of visitors.
- I.12 The key local plan Policy OE4 seeks to reduce light pollution by only permitting essential and appropriate lighting proposals that incorporate good lighting management and design, in order to remove unacceptable adverse impacts on the visual character of the landscape, seascape and historic built environment; on wildlife and habitats; and on local visual amenity and safety.

Policy OE4 Protecting Scilly's Dark Skies

1) Development proposals that include external lighting will only be permitted where it can be demonstrated that the lights are essential for safety, security or community reasons, and where details are provided of attempts to minimise light pollution, including:

- a) **costs to the environment (including the unnecessary use of electricity);**
 - b) **skyglow (visible glow caused by scattering and reflection from clouds and the atmosphere);**
 - c) **light nuisance (creating amenity nuisance, highway hazards and restricted views of the night sky);**
 - d) **and glare (over-bright and poorly directed lights that dazzle or discomfort those who need to see, by concealing rather than revealing)**
- I.13 The dark sky is important to the islands as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, with Dark Sky Discovery Sites identified for each inhabited islands.
- I.14 Whilst the Isles of Scilly is the darkest district in the UK the imagery of the archipelago shows that Hugh Town is the one bright and lit settlement amongst the islands. Notwithstanding this the design has been carefully considered to meet the policy requirements.
- I.15 In terms of the criteria of the policy the lighting chosen is compliant as explained below:

Tregarthen's Hotel

- a) The light fittings are lit by LED bulbs with very high energy efficiency, and the micro lodges are being fitted with PV panels to generate renewable electricity.
- b) Given the inbuilt cowls the units will not contribute to skyglow
- c) The proposed lights will not give rise to nuisance as they are direct towards the ground
- d) The lighting colour and illumination will not give rise to unacceptable glare

1.16 Overall the lights chosen are appropriate to the policy constraints.

Amenity Impacts

1.17 The lights have been chosen for the directional lamps and integral cowls that spread light downwards towards the path. The light fittings cannot be adapted to remove the cowls.

1.18 The nearest neighbour is 20m from Unit 5, but the unit is at a much lower level than the neighbouring property and given the integral cowls there will be very little light spill upwards towards the neighbour, and certainly not sufficient to cause any nuisance. This will improve on the historically fitted lighting, which is to be removed, as that has given rise to complaints previously.

Heritage Impacts

1.19 The proposals will have only very minor additional impacts on the historic built environment, than those impacts already deemed as acceptable under the previous approvals for development. Advice from Historic England on earlier schemes was as follows:

1.20 *Historic England therefore considers that it is for your authority to carry out a balancing exercise between the public benefits of the proposal and (as per the previous scheme) any residual low levels of harm (National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), paragraph 196).*

1.21 In terms of heritage impact in relation to the designated heritage assets including views to the Garrison Wall (SAM) adjacent listed buildings: Portlight and Starboard Light and the conservation area in general the proposal would be considered less than substantial. This residual low-level harm to heritage needs to be considered against the public benefits of pedestrian safety.

1.22 It should be concluded therefore that in relation to the impact upon the historic environment the proposal is considered to be in accordance with Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan 2015-2030.

Impact on AONB, Conservation Area and Historic Environment

1.23 The previous assessment of the proposal confirmed:

Tregarthen's Hotel

- 1.24 *As per the previously concluded report for application P/20/090/IFUL the construction of the five lodges, as now amended, on the north side of the hotel creates a positive form of development that would enhance the existing under-used north side of the Tregarthen's complex. The structures will partially obscure some of the less sympathetic buildings, which are directly adjacent to the Garrison Walls, without obscuring the wall to any perceptibly greater degree than the previously approved lodges. Although the design breaks from the white render structures of Tregarthen's, I consider that the proposal would result in positive benefits that will enhance the character of this area as a result.*
- 1.25 This additional application for lighting is a necessary part of making the new tourist accommodation function well and remain safe and attractive to visitors. Hugh Town is a lit settlement and already has impacts of artificial lighting as shown in the satellite imagery in the Local Plan on page 156 and explained in the lighting assessment which concludes as follows.
- 1.26 The installation of the Proposed Lighting in accordance with the Lighting Strategy and the removal of the luminaires identified in Section 7 of that strategy will result in a positive effect on the surrounding environment, reducing the upward skyward radiance, and impact on the view of the landscape.
- 1.27 Through careful design and mitigation, this Lighting Strategy ensures the lighting installation at the proposed development will be in accordance with British Standards, Guidance and Local Policy.
- 1.28 The removal of the fittings identified in the lighting report, the mounting heights significantly lower than that of the lights surrounding the Application Site, and the installation of IDA approved luminaires will result in a positive effect on the surround environment, comparatively to the current baseline levels of light.

Conclusion - The Planning Balance and Recommendation

- 1.29 In coming to a conclusion on the proposal the planning authority must consider whether the proposal constitutes sustainable development and consider the balance of harms and benefits of the proposal given legislation, the development plan policy framework and guidance in the NPPF as a material consideration.
- 1.30 The proposal as described and assessed in this statement has shown no harm to the amenity of adjacent residents and only minor impacts that will occur from this essential scheme of lighting, indeed the scheme shows a positive benefit on the surrounding environment. The scheme has overall compliance with National and Local Policy and with no demonstrable harms that outweigh the benefits, assessed against the policies of the Framework as a whole, the applicant respectfully requests that planning permission should be granted without delay.