

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/098/LBC

Consultation Request: Conservation Officer

Date: 21st November 2025

Ref: [P/25/098/LBC](#)

Site: Treskey, The Garrison, St Mary's, Isles Of Scilly.

Proposal: Listed building consent for proposed replacement windows.

You are being consulted on this application as archaeological input is required to inform the decision. Please complete the response form below and return to planning@scilly.gov.uk as soon as possible and no later than **12th December 2025** or by post to the Planning Department, Old Wesleyan Chapel, Garrison Lane, St Mary's, Isles of Scilly TR21 0JD.

I look forward to receiving your comments in due course.

Comments:

The Building

The property was grade II* listed in Feb 1975 when it was described as;

Garrison Stores, later house. c.1716-1718; porch and internal alterations by Richardson and Gill, 1927; restored 1971. Roughly coursed granite rubble with dressed granite; stone-coped gabled slate roof; rendered end stacks. Double-depth plan. 2 storeys and attics; symmetrical 5-window range. Segmental arches with dressed voussoirs and keystones over horned 8/8-pane sashes. Porch with cambered roof has similar sash to front and granite lintel over 4-panelled door to left return. Dressed quoins rise from plinth to coved cornice. Hipped dormers with slate-hung cheeks and segmental-arched horned 6/6-pane sashes. Courtyard to rear enclosed by mid C19 extension to south, 1960s rear (east) range and mid C19 north range with brick segmental arch over entry connected to bays in same style as early C18 range with keyed segmental arch over horned 8/8-pane sash above double entry with C20 panelled screen and C20 porch.

Interior: chamfered reused beams and early C18 dog-leg with landing staircase with moulded handrail and turned balusters on closed string. Originally built as the garrison storehouse at a cost of £306 15s 10d.

An important and mostly complete example of its type, part of an important fortification and one of the most architecturally elaborate buildings on the islands. (P Laws: The Buildings of Scilly: Redruth: 1980-: 10

The site is recorded in the HER as;

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/098/LBC

Newman House, originally known as the Storehouse, is a substantial C18 military store house with associated workshops and other buildings around a courtyard.

Heritage Gateway - Results

Grade II* listed buildings represent only 5% of all listed buildings and are of more than special interest. They are designated heritage assets of the *highest* significance.

Statutory Duty and Policy

We have a duty under section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have '*special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historical interest which it possesses*' when considering applications that affect listed buildings.

Part 16 of the NPPF and the accompanying planning practice guidance –

Heritage assets are an irreplaceable resource and should be conserved in a manner appropriate to their significance, so that they can be enjoyed for their contribution to the quality of life of existing and future generations (paragraph 202).

Great weight should be given to the asset's conservation (and the more important the asset, the greater the weight should be). This is irrespective of whether any potential harm amounts to substantial harm, total loss or less than substantial harm to its significance (paragraph 212). Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification (paragraph 213)

Policy OE7 of the Isles of Scilly Local Plan, adopted in 2021, reinforces that any harm to the significance of a designated or non-designated heritage asset must be justified and that proposals causing harm will be weighed against the substantial public, not private, benefits of the proposal. Also, that it should be demonstrated that all reasonable efforts have been made to mitigate the extent of the harm to the significance of the asset.

Making Changes to Heritage Assets – Historic England Advice note 2 states:

42. The historic fabric will always be an important part of the asset's significance, in normal circumstances the retention of as much historic fabric as possible, together with the appropriate use of materials and methods of repair is likely to conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance, as a fundamental part of any good alteration or conversion. It is not appropriate to sacrifice old work simply to accommodate the new.

Advice

The application is seeking consent for replacement windows.

The existing windows are said to be modern replicas installed during restorations during the 1970s and have modern glass. The photos provided with the applicants Heritage Statement would suggest this is the case.

Council of the Isles of Scilly Planning Application

Ref: P/25/098/LBC

The joiners report from Camborne Joinery states that 90% of the windows have extensive rot and decay with evidence of previous failed repairs.

As such the proposals are considered to be justified.

The submitted details show the proposed new timber replacements to be matching single glazed hardwood timber units, putty fixed with box frames and sash weights. The windows will have a paint finish.

The impact on the character, significance and historic integrity of the listed building will be neutral.

No further details are required.

Completed By	Time Spent	Date
Vic Robinson – Senior Development Officer (Historic Environment) Cornwall Council	1 hour	10 th Dec 2025
P/25/098/LBC		